TODAY’S FAMILY MAPS & TOMORROW’S POSSIBILITIES: FAMILY FORMATIONS AND LGBTQ PARENTING

Fiona Tasker
Birkbeck University Of London, UK
September 5-8, 2018
LGBTQ PARENTING RESEARCH: PAST, PRESENT & FUTURE?
A SUPER-QUICK OVERVIEW
LGBTQ+ Parenting Research: 1980s To Now

Reviews have identified 3 waves of research on same sex parenting (e.g. Golombok, 2007; Johnson, 2012)

Johnson’s 2012 Waves:

1st wave: lesbians (gay men) who had become parents while in heterosexual relationships (family & child outcome comparisons with heterosexual families)

2nd wave: examined women (gay men) who became parents in the context of a lesbian identity (family & child outcome comparisons with heterosexual families)

3rd wave: unique challenges faced by lesbian mothers (how to manage sexual minority stress). For example: Decisions about donor conception or whose sperm to use; the challenge of coping with stigma

I propose a 4th wave: allowing family members to self-define (queering of parenting and an increase interest in bisexual, trans and gender (nonconforming) diversity in parenting)

NB waves coincide (greater or lesser extent) in different societies
1st wave: lesbians (gay men) who had become parents while in heterosexual relationships

2nd wave: examined women (gay men) who then planned children

3rd wave: examining unique challenges

New (?) 4th wave: self-defining LGBTQ+ parented families
Foucault (1976/1978) *History of sexuality*
interpreting the past in the eyes of the present
(i.e. it’s all too easy to classify especially with hindsight ... each generation looks back, forward and across as well as within)
Britain & Victorian Family Values

The Victorians: Oscar Wilde & Lord Alfred Douglas, Constance & sons Cyril & Vyvyan

Oscar Wilde & Lord Alfred Douglas 1893

Oscar, Constance, and Cyril Wilde 1892

Constance Lloyd in 2013 (Danny Osborne) Dublin
The Greeks and the Romans: Hadrian, his Greek love Antonius, and a marriage to Vibia Sabina

Hadrian & Antinous

Deification of Antinous
The First Wave
Post-heterosexual Relationship Dissolution (PHR)

Lesbians (gay men) who became parents in heterosexual relationships (family & child outcome comparisons)

Tasker & Golombok, 1997; Tasker, 2013; Tasker & Rensten (in press)
Simultaneous Waves Of LGB-parenting Research
Victor Figueroa Guinez’s Chilean studies of lesbian motherhood
• Study (Wave) 1 Narrative identities lesbian motherhood PHR
• Study (Wave) 2 Parenting desires and intentions among Chilean young lesbian and bisexual women.
• Wave 3 experiential variation within studies 1 & 2 Chile (March 2012) Karen Atala custody award Inter-American Court of Human Rights
Sociohistorical Context: Exploration Cultural Comparisons

Victor Figueroa Guinez, Jorge Gato, Martin Tusl, Vanessa Leme, & Fiona Tasker work in progress

Cross-cultural data on responses to the same vignette (with central characters being either lesbian, gay or heterosexual parents) from students in Chile, Portugal, Czech Republic, Brazil & UK
The Second Wave: Planned Same-sex Couple Families

Lesbians (gay men) becoming parents after coming out as lesbian or gay (family & child outcome comparisons)
Third Wave: Unique Challenges: How to manage sexual minority stress & the decisions heterosexual people don’t have to make
Total N=253 adoptive parents in the UK
• N=39 gay or bisexual fathers
• N=36 lesbian or bisexual mothers
• N=71 heterosexual parents
Current EAF Findings

What factors were associated with adopted children’s psychosocial adjustment?

• No difference scores on SDQ / PANAS-x between GF LM H parenting groups

• Irrespective of parenting group SDQ & PANAS-x associated with preadoption problems

EAF website http://pcos59.wixsite.com/empoweradoptfamilies
Current EAF Findings

Were “harder-to-place” children placed with LGB parents?

• No differences in adoption approval time
• No differences children’s previous institutional or foster care placements
• No differences children’s pre-adoption problems
• Child’s demographic characteristics
  more likely to adopt boys $G > L / H$
  more likely adopt an older child $G > L / H$
  more likely adopt child from an ethnic minority group $L > G / H$
  more likely adopt a child with a physical disability $L/H > G$
Next Phase EAF

In Portugal, online EAF survey of adoptive parenting.

In the UK, follow-up interview visits using family maps with adoptive parents and children in all three groups to explore conceptualization of new family forms.
The Fourth Wave? Bisexual, Trans & Gender Diverse (Non-Binary) Parenting Projects
The 4th Wave: Bisexual, Trans, Gender Diverse &/or Queer?

The two spirit contingent marches at San Francisco Pride 2014
Do LGBTQ people extend the boundaries of family by forming non-heteronormative family types and by ‘doing’ family in non-traditional ways?

The heteronormative family is the equivalent of Standard North American Family (SNAF: Smith, 1993) refers to the dominant family schema in North America. It consists of a heterosexual legally married couple and any children who co-reside in the same household. The father is a breadwinner and the mother may work for pay but is mainly responsible for care and household labor. (Grady, 2016, in The Wiley Blackwell Encyclopedia of Family Studies. DOI: 10.1002/9781119085621.wbefs049)
New Heteronormative = Homonormative?

One big (straight, gay, multicultural, traditional) happy (?) family

the Modern Family
Genealogy & Genograms Revisited

Genealogy & pedigrees

new interest in genealogy as a social research tool

Kretsedemas 2017:1 “What new forms of cultural agency and filtration does it [genealogy] make possible? (And just as important, what .. does it rule out?)”

2013 Family Tree | Modern Family ABC.com

“Explore the interactive family tree to see how the Dunphys, Delgados, Tuckers and Pritchettts all fit together as one big family!”
Genograms

Traditionally family relationships mapped through genograms using standard symbols to develop a pictorial description of family relationships across and within generations.

Genograms developed by Monica McGoldrick and colleagues (McGoldrick, Gerson & Petry, 2008) at the Multicultural Family Institute New Jersey [McGoldrick et al., 2008] at the Multicultural Family Institute New Jersey [https://multiculturalfamily.org/]

New developments to genograms e.g. ecomaps (Hartman,
Family Members Defining Family

Family Map measures (Tasker, Malley & Costa, in press).

- adults (Family Map Exercise)
- children (Apple Tree Families)
- https://familymappingexercises.wordpress.com

Maeve Malley, Mary Swainson, Julia Granville
Institute of Family Therapy
Lesbian Parenting Projects

Adult FME see Swainson, M & Tasker, F (2005) Genograms redrawn: Lesbian couples define their families

Bisexual Parenting Project

MARIE DELVOYE & FIONA TASKER (FUNDING FROM LEONARDO DA VINCI (EU) TRAINING PLACEMENT)
# UK Bisexual Parenting Project Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Age range</th>
<th>Self-defined sexual identity</th>
<th>Current relationship status as given by participant</th>
<th>Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elena</td>
<td>Mid-twenties</td>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td>Married to a male partner</td>
<td>1 son under ten years old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzie</td>
<td>Mid-thirties</td>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td>Married to a male partner Casually dating women</td>
<td>1 teenage son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elizabeth</td>
<td>Early forties</td>
<td>Lesbian</td>
<td>Living with a male partner</td>
<td>2 sons under ten years old Teenage stepdaughter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laura</td>
<td>Mid-forties</td>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td>In a casual relationship with a male partner</td>
<td>3 children under ten years old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrea</td>
<td>Mid-forties</td>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td>Single Casual sexual relationship with a male partner Intimate non-sexual friendship with a female partner</td>
<td>Son under ten years old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrie</td>
<td>Mid-forties</td>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td>Divorced from a male partner Living with a female partner</td>
<td>3 grown up children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbara</td>
<td>Mid-fifties</td>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td>Single In a casual relationship (partner’s gender unknown)</td>
<td>2 grown up children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lynn</td>
<td>Mid-fifties</td>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td>Living with a male partner</td>
<td>1 grown up son</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Family Map Thematic Analysis

Family Core: Caring connections and the ongoing parenting of grown up offspring

Thinking within and beyond heteronormative boundaries: a challenge to include new partners in family networks

Traditional extended family relatives included because they are good enough to be counted upon and share a common allegiance

Ex-partners mostly warranting inclusion as the children’s other parent

Affirming bisexuality through choosing family
Family core: caring connections and the ongoing parenting of grown up offspring. Carrie’s Family Map
Traditional extended family relatives included because they are good enough to be counted upon and share a common allegiance

Carrie’s Family Map
... Or Excluded Elizabeth
Thinking within & beyond heteronormative boundaries: the challenge of finding a way to include new partners in family networks

Suzie’s Family Map

- Grandparents
- ½ Brothers (x4) – My Dad – My Mum
- His Mum – His Dad → Siblings
- Girlfriend – Her partner?
- Friends
- - Best Friends
  - Step Mother Friend (trans friend) – not really involved with my blood family.
Ex-partners Mostly Warranting Inclusion As The Children’s Other Parent. Andrea’s Family Map
Affirming bisexuality through choosing family. Laura’s Family Map
Conclusions
Diverse composition of cisgender bisexual mothers families and family relationships sustaining, or weakening, bisexual parental identity.

Complex and difficult identity work done by mothers at different points in their family life cycles as they contended with or resisted the heteronormative-homonormative binary

Claims to kinship & identity being performed: inclusions & exclusions being made in family life that ultimately make statements about self embedded in a network of allegiances and reciprocal responsibilities.
The Fourth Wave?
Trans & Gender Diverse
(Non-Binary) Parenting Projects
Prospective LGBTQ+ Parenting
Jorge Gato, Anne Marie Fontaine, Carmen Moreno, Maria del Mar González & Fiona Tasker
Funding from Fundação para a Ciência e Tecnologia (Portugal) & British Academy & Leverhulme Foundation (UK)

prospective lesbian and gay parenting in Portugal, Spain and the UK
Leal, Gato & Tasker (in press) Prospective Parenting: Sexual Identity and Intercultural Trajectories

comparisons between LGB & Heterosexual respondents in Portugal & the UK: differences between LGB and heterosexuals & differences irrespective of sexual identity between Portuguese & UK respondents

Online Survey: To have or not to have children?
Thoughts About Parenthood In The Future: Focus Groups With Trans & Gender Diverse People
Fiona Tasker, Jorge Gato & thanks to Annalisa Pantella

Data collection:
3 Focus Group (FG) interviews with N=11
   FG1 4 participants
   FG2 7 participants
   FG3 4 participants reviewing 1st iteration themes & subthemes from FG1&2

Data analyses: Thematic Analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2013)
Theme 1: Planning To Be A Parent

Subthemes:

a) want to have children but need to get ready to have children

b) a diversity of family forms to support parenthood are possible

c) Having support from extended family is important for deciding to have children, especially if no partner, but if you do not have it, you just plan and get on with it
Theme 2: Who I Am Doesn’t Fit Into The Cis-gendered System & The Consequences Of This
Subthemes:

a) If you don’t conform to the gender binary then parenting is a social challenge but not a medical one

b) But if you’re trans it’s relatively straightforward socially but complicated medically and often blocked because: lack of medical knowledge, assumption that if you’re trans you won’t want children ... so you end up fighting the system
Theme 3: Quest for a gendered or non-gendered feeling of being yourself (authenticity) challenged by reproduction so need for a flexible future parenthood plan

a) Problem with biological fertility or the lack of it is that it challenges your non-cisgendered sense of self

b) Paradoxically feeling happier with your gendered self makes you feel more like pursuing life goals like parenthood (keep fertility under review)

c) Taking a pragmatic approach: avoid reading reproductive parts as gendered parts, but that’s really difficult to do when others misread them

d) The opportunity to preserve own fertility aside from whether or not a baby is produced is worth having
Trans Men & Babies Project

FIONA TASKER & JORGE GATO
Trans and Gender Nonbinary People Carrying Babies

Thomas Beatie the first man in the world to give birth (2008) CREDIT: OPRAH
D’s pre-birth Family Map
Conclusion: What Makes Family?

For LGBTQ people
Families are about more than kinship ties

Family can enable and cherish but also coercively constrain.

Families have fluidity of form from individual life cycles of their members, the aspirations of members and the entry/exit of members.

LGBTQ people pushing back the boundaries of family but we eagerly await other new frontiers of family in the future.

THANK YOU
References


References


